

## GNSO Review Recommendations - changes from Draft to Final Report

Prepared by Westlake Governance - September 2015

Rec No.	Recommendation: Draft for Public Comment	Decision in response to Public Comment	Recommendation: Final
1	Develop and monitor metrics to evaluate the ongoing effectiveness of current outreach strategies and pilot programmes with regard to GNSO Working Groups (WGs) (as noted in the WG participation recommendations under section 5.4.5)	No change	That the GNSO develop and monitor metrics to evaluate the ongoing effectiveness of current outreach strategies and pilot programmes with regard to GNSO Working Groups (WGs) (as noted in the WG participation recommendations under section 5.4.5)
2	Develop and fund more targeted programmes to recruit volunteers and broaden participation in PDP WGs, given the vital role volunteers play in Working Groups and policy development.	No change	That the GNSO develop and fund more targeted programmes to recruit volunteers and broaden participation in PDP WGs, given the vital role volunteers play in Working Groups and policy development.
3	Review the level, scope and targeting of financial assistance to ensure volunteers are able to participate on a footing comparable with those who participate in GNSO as part of their profession.	Amend comparator - minimum standard, not equal footing. Aim is to remove barriers to effective participation	That the GNSO Council reduce or remove cost barriers to volunteer participation in WGs.
4	Explore a tailored incentive system to increase the motivation of volunteers. (For example, this may include training & development opportunities or greater recognition of individuals).	Altered to clarify recognising and rewarding (remove "incentive")	That the GNSO Council introduce non-financial rewards and recognition for volunteers.
5	Continue initiatives that aim to reduce the barriers to newcomers.	Existing recommendation 29 (new member input) added to this recommendation	That, during each WG self-assessment, new members be asked how their input has been solicited and considered.
6	That the GNSO record and regularly publish statistics on WG participation (including diversity statistics).	No change	That the GNSO record and regularly publish statistics on WG participation (including diversity statistics).
7	That Stakeholder Groups (SGs) and Constituencies (Cs) explore and implement ways to engage more deeply with community members whose first language is other than English, as a means to overcoming language barriers.	Recommendation strengthened See row 54	That Stakeholder Groups (SGs) and Constituencies (Cs) engage more deeply with community members whose first language is other than English, as a means to overcoming language barriers.

8	That WGs should have an explicit role in responding to implementation issues related to policy they have developed, and that the current Policy and Implementation Working Group specifically address the role of WGs in responding to policy implementation issues.	Footnote added to recommendation.	That WGs should have an explicit role in responding to implementation issues related to policy they have developed.
9	That a formal Working Group leadership assessment programme be developed as part of the overall training and development programme.	No change	That a formal Working Group leadership assessment programme be developed as part of the overall training and development programme.
10	That a professional facilitator/moderator is used in certain situations (for example, when policy issues are complex, where members of the WG are generally inexperienced and/or where WG members have interests that conflict), and that the GNSO develop guidelines for the circumstances in which professional facilitators/moderators are used for Working Groups.	Recommendation modified to include need for criteria, and remove examples	That the GNSO Council develop criteria for WGs to engage a professional facilitator/moderator in certain situations.
11	That the face-to-face PDP WG pilot project be assessed when completed. If the results are beneficial, guidelines should be developed and support funding made available.	No change	That the face-to-face PDP WG pilot project be assessed when completed. If the results are beneficial, guidelines should be developed and support funding made available.
12	That ICANN assess the feasibility of providing a real-time transcribing service in audio conferences for prioritised PDP WGs.	Recommendation modified	That ICANN assess the feasibility of providing a real-time transcribing service in audio conferences for WG meetings.
13	That ICANN evaluate one or more alternative decision support systems and experiment with these for supporting WGs.	Recommendation strengthened	That the GNSO Council evaluate and, if appropriate, pilot a technology solution (such as Loomio or similar) to facilitate wider participation in WG consensus-based decision making.
14	That the GNSO further explores PDP 'chunking' and examines each potential PDP as to its feasibility for breaking into discrete stages.	No change	That the GNSO further explores PDP 'chunking' and examines each potential PDP as to its feasibility for breaking into discrete stages.
15	That the GNSO continues current PDP Improvements Project initiatives to address timeliness of the PDP.	No change	That the GNSO continues current PDP Improvements Project initiatives to address timeliness of the PDP.
16	That a policy impact assessment (PIA) be included as a standard part of any policy process.	No change	That a policy impact assessment (PIA) be included as a standard part of any policy process.

17	That the practice of Working Group self-evaluation becomes standard at the completion of the WG's work; and that these evaluations should be published and used as a basis for continual process improvement in the PDP.	Recommendation modified to be a part of the PDP	That the practice of Working Group self-evaluation be incorporated into the policy development process; and that these evaluations should be published and used as a basis for continual process improvement in the PDP.
18	That the GNSO Council evaluate post implementation policy effectiveness on an ongoing basis (rather than periodically as stated in the current GNSO Operating Procedures); and that these evaluations are analysed by the GNSO Council to monitor and improve the drafting and scope of future PDP Charters and facilitate the effectiveness of GNSO policy outcomes over time.	No change	That the GNSO Council evaluate post implementation policy effectiveness on an ongoing basis (rather than periodically as stated in the current GNSO Operating Procedures); and that these evaluations are analysed by the GNSO Council to monitor and improve the drafting and scope of future PDP Charters and facilitate the effectiveness of GNSO policy outcomes over time.
19	As strategic manager rather than a policy body the GNSO Council should continue to focus on ensuring that a WG has been properly constituted, has thoroughly fulfilled the terms of its charter and has followed due process.	No change	As strategic manager rather than a policy body the GNSO Council should continue to focus on ensuring that a WG has been properly constituted, has thoroughly fulfilled the terms of its charter and has followed due process.
20	That the GNSO Council should review annually ICANN's Strategic Objectives with a view to planning future policy development that strikes a balance between ICANN's Strategic Objectives and the GNSO resources available for policy development.	No change	That the GNSO Council should review annually ICANN's Strategic Objectives with a view to planning future policy development that strikes a balance between ICANN's Strategic Objectives and the GNSO resources available for policy development.
21	The GNSO Council should regularly undertake or commission analysis of trends in gTLDs in order to forecast their likely requirements for policy and to ensure those affected are well-represented in the policy-making process.	No change	That the GNSO Council should regularly undertake or commission analysis of trends in gTLDs in order to forecast likely requirements for policy and to ensure those affected are well-represented in the policy-making process.
22	That the GNSO should review and implement a revised training and development programme encompassing	Recommendation clarified	That the GNSO Council develop a competency-based framework, which its members should utilise to identify development needs and opportunities.

23	<p>That the GNSO Council and SGs and Cs adhere to the published process for applications for new constituencies. That the ICANN Board in assessing an application satisfy itself that all parties have followed due process. Subject to the application meeting the conditions, the default outcome should be that a new Constituency is admitted.</p>	<p>Existing recommendation 23 combined with 24. New recommendation 23 added re Constituency representation on GNSO Council</p>	<p>In order to support ICANN's multi-stakeholder model, all Cs should have seats on the GNSO Council, allocated equally (as far as numerically practicable) by their SGs.</p>
24	<p>That all applications for new constituencies, including historic applications, be published on the ICANN website with full transparency of decision-making.</p>	<p>No change</p>	<p>That the GNSO Council and SGs and Cs adhere to the published process for applications for new constituencies. That the ICANN Board in assessing an application satisfy itself that all parties have followed the published process, subject to which the default outcome is that a new Constituency is admitted. That all applications for new Constituencies, including historic applications, be published on the ICANN website with full transparency of decision-making.</p>
25	<p>That the GNSO Council commission the development of, and implement, guidelines to provide assistance for groups wishing to establish a new Constituency.</p>	<p>No change</p>	<p>That the GNSO Council commission the development of, and implement, guidelines to provide assistance for groups wishing to establish a new Constituency.</p>
26	<p>That GNSO Council members, Executive Committee members of SGs and Cs and members of WGs complete and maintain a current, comprehensive Sol. Where individuals represent bodies or clients, this information is to be posted. If not posted because of client confidentiality, the participant's interest or position must be disclosed. Failing either of these, the individual not be permitted to participate.</p>	<p>Recommendation strengthened</p>	<p>That GNSO Council members, Executive Committee members of SGs and Cs and members of WGs complete and maintain a current, comprehensive SOI on the GNSO website. Where individuals represent bodies or clients, this information is to be posted. If not posted because of client confidentiality, the participant's interest or position must be disclosed. Failing either of these, the individual not be permitted to participate.</p>
27	<p>That the GNSO establish and maintain a centralised publicly available list of members and individual participants of every Constituency and Stakeholder Group (with a link to the individual's SOI where one is required and posted).</p>	<p>No change</p>	<p>That the GNSO establish and maintain a centralised publicly available list of members and individual participants of every Constituency and Stakeholder Group (with a link to the individual's SOI where one is required and posted).</p>

28	That section 6.1.2 of the GNSO Operating Procedures be revised, as shown in Appendix 6, to clarify that key clauses are mandatory rather than advisory, and to institute meaningful sanctions for non-compliance where appropriate.	No change	That section 6.1.2 of the GNSO Operating Procedures be revised, as shown in Appendix 6, to clarify that key clauses are mandatory rather than advisory, and to institute meaningful sanctions for non-compliance where appropriate.
29	That new members of WGs and newcomers at ICANN meetings be surveyed to determine how well their input is solicited and accepted by the community, and that the results be published and considered by the GNSO Council at its next meeting.	New member input added to recommendation 5. New recommendation 29 added leadership tenure reporting	That SOIs of GNSO Council Members and Executive Committee members of all SGs and Cs include the total number of years that person has held leadership positions in ICANN.
30	That the GNSO develop and implement a policy for the provision of administrative support for SGs and Cs; and that SGs and Cs annually review and evaluate the effectiveness of administrative support they receive.	No change	That the GNSO develop and implement a policy for the provision of administrative support for SGs and Cs; and that SGs and Cs annually review and evaluate the effectiveness of administrative support they receive.
31	That the GAC-GNSO Consultation Group on GAC Early Engagement in the GNSO Policy Development Process continue its two work streams as priority projects. As a part of its work it should consider how the GAC could appoint a non-binding, non-voting liaison to the WG of each relevant GNSO PDP as a means of providing timely input.	No change	That the GAC-GNSO Consultation Group on GAC Early Engagement in the GNSO Policy Development Process continue its two work streams as priority projects. As a part of its work it should consider how the GAC could appoint a non-binding, non-voting liaison to the WG of each relevant GNSO PDP as a means of providing timely input.
32	That ICANN define “cultural diversity” and that relevant metrics (encompassing geographic, gender, age group and cultural, possibly by using birth language) be monitored and published.	Add 'regularly'	That ICANN define “cultural diversity” (possibly by using birth language); and regularly publish this along with geographic, gender and age group metrics, at least for the GNSO Council, SGs, Cs and WGs.
33	That SGs, Cs and the Nominating Committee, in selecting their candidates for appointment to the GNSO Council, should aim to increase the geographic, gender and cultural diversity of its participants, as defined in ICANN Core Value 4.	No change	That SGs, Cs and the Nominating Committee, in selecting their candidates for appointment to the GNSO Council, should aim to increase the geographic, gender and cultural diversity of its participants, as defined in ICANN Core Value 4.

34	That PDP WGs rotate the start time of their meetings in order not to disadvantage people who wish to participate from anywhere in the world. This should be the norm for PDP WG meetings even if at first all the WG's members come from the "traditional" regions of North America and Europe.	Second sentence of recommendation deleted	That PDP WGs rotate the start time of their meetings in order not to disadvantage people who wish to participate from anywhere in the world.
35	That the GNSO Council establish a WG, whose membership specifically reflects the demographic, cultural and gender diversity of the Internet as a whole, to identify and develop ways to reduce barriers to participation in the GNSO by non-English speakers and those with limited command of English.	No change	That the GNSO Council establish a WG, whose membership specifically reflects the demographic, cultural, gender and age diversity of the Internet as a whole, to recommend to Council ways to reduce barriers to participation in the GNSO by non-English speakers and those with limited command of English.
36	That, when approving the formation of a PDP WG, the GNSO Council require that its membership represent as far as reasonably practicable the geographic, cultural and gender diversity of the Internet as a whole. Additionally, that when approving GNSO Policy, the ICANN Board explicitly satisfy itself that the GNSO Council undertook these actions when approving the formation of a PDP WG.	No change	That, when approving the formation of a PDP WG, the GNSO Council require that its membership represent as far as reasonably practicable the geographic, cultural and gender diversity of the Internet as a whole. Additionally, that when approving GNSO Policy, the ICANN Board explicitly satisfy itself that the GNSO Council undertook these actions when approving the formation of a PDP WG.