JIG Initial Report on Universal Acceptance of IDN TLDs

Date: July 19, 2011

Version: DRAFT 0.1

This report is intended to be a document to solicit input from the community. The document is a preliminary stocktaking of policy and other considerations as well as possible actions to take by ICANN and the ICANN community to address such issues in support of the implementation of IDN gTLDs and IDN ccTLDs.

The JIG (Joint ccNSO-GNSO IDN Working Group) was created to discuss issues of common interest between the ccNSO and the GNSO on IDNs (Internationalized Domain Names), especially IDN TLDs. The JIG has identified 3 issues of common interest to date:

1. Single Character IDN TLDs
2. IDN TLD Variants
3. Universal Acceptance of IDN TLDs

This report is specific to issue 3. Universal Acceptance of IDN TLDs.

**I. Background & Related Works**

The issue of the Universal Acceptance of TLDs is not new. The introduction of new gTLDs, especially those that are longer than 3 characters exposed this Universal Acceptance issue in the 2000 experimental expansion round, and was continued to be felt through the 2004 sTLD extension round. The introduction of IDN ccTLDs through the IDN ccTLD fast track in 2010 further exposed the issue and also made this into an issue of common interest between ccTLDs and gTLDs.

The upcoming introduction of new gTLDs is

[THIS SECTION WILL BE WRITTEN OUT WITH BETTER ELABORATION IN THE NEXT VERSION, THE FOLLOWING IS A COLLECTION OF THE RELATED INFORMATION AND LINKS]

* Universal Acceptance of All TLDs: http://www.icann.org/en/topics/TLD-acceptance/
  + SSAC Recommendations (Aug 25, 2003): <http://forum.icann.org/mtg-cmts/stld-rfp-comments/general/doc00004.doc>
  + RFC3696 (Feb 2004): <http://www.ietf.org/rfc/rfc3696>
  + Discussion forum (Oct 18, 2004): <http://forum.icann.org/lists/tld-acceptance/>
  + TLD Verification Tool (Beta: Dec 3, 2006, Beta 3: Mar 22, 2007): <http://www.icann.org/en/announcements/announcement-2-22mar07.htm>
* Public Suffix List
  + Initiative started (June 2006): <https://bugzilla.mozilla.org/show_bug.cgi?id=342314>
  + Publicized (Oct 2006): <http://weblogs.mozillazine.org/gerv/archives/2006/10/dns_structure.html>
  + <http://publicsuffix.org/>
  + Uses: <http://publicsuffix.org/learn/>
* Wikipedia TLD list: <http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/List_of_Internet_top-level_domains>
  + Page created (March 2004): <http://en.wikipedia.org/w/index.php?title=List_of_Internet_top-level_domains&oldid=2806612>
* Mozilla IDN-Enabled TLD list: <http://www.mozilla.org/projects/security/tld-idn-policy-list.html>
  + Initiated (March 2005): <https://bugzilla.mozilla.org/show_bug.cgi?id=286534>
* Unique authoritative root:
  + RFC2826 (May 2000): <http://www.ietf.org/rfc/rfc2826>
  + Draft (May 28, 2001): <http://www.icann.org/en/meetings/stockholm/unique-root-draft.htm>
  + ICP-3 (July 9, 2001): <http://www.icann.org/en/icp/icp-3.htm>
  + Challenged (Aug 8, 2001): <http://www.icann.org/en/committees/reconsideration/weinberg-request-08aug01.htm>
  + Reaffirmed (Jan 18, 2002): <http://www.icann.org/en/committees/reconsideration/weinberg-request-08aug01.htm>

**II. ICANN Policy and Coordination Considerations on the Universal Acceptance of IDN TLDs**

In considering the scope of work at the JIG, the group is cognizant of work that is currently done on the topic, including the Universal Acceptance of All TLDs (<http://www.icann.org/en/topics/TLD-acceptance/>) and those from the ICANN community participating in the maintenance of the Public Suffix List (<http://publicsuffix.org>), and understands that the charter of this group is focused on aspects relevant to issues of common interest between the ccNSO and the GNSO. Given the nature of the issue of Universal Acceptance of TLDs, nevertheless, the group has included both policy aspects as well as coordination roles that could be led by ICANN and the ICANN community in its stocktaking and recommendations on this subject.

More specifically, it is noted that while policies developed at and enforced by ICANN may not directly solve the issue of Universal Acceptance, the JIG recognized certain areas of influence by ICANN along with supportive policies at ICANN can contribute to the promotion of the goal of the Universal Acceptance of IDN TLDs by Internet applications, devices, infrastructure and other hardware and software systems.

The following are policy and coordination considerations identified:

1. Are there policy aspects to be considered and/or policies to be implemented at ICANN?
   1. Budgeting policies?
   2. Registry policies? IDN ccTLDs and/vs. IDN gTLDs?
2. Which organizations should ICANN work with on the issue and how should ICANN identify such organizations?
   1. Industry, regional and related organizations
      1. Industry organizations, e.g. IDN SDC, etc.
      2. Regional organizations, e.g. RIRs, ISP associations, etc.
      3. IT related organizations, e.g. WITSA (<http://www.witsa.org>), etc.
   2. Emerging industry standards
      1. Public Suffix List currently maintained at Mozilla
      2. Wikipedia TLD List
3. Which areas should ICANN focus its efforts and exert its influence on?
   1. Browsers and DNS Lookup tools and components
   2. Network infrastructure, hosting and email providers
   3. Network management and security tools
   4. Applications and databases (where domains, email addresses and/or URLs represents a data object maintained, e.g. user profiles, contact information, search engines, etc.)
   5. Registries, Registrars and RIR systems
4. What types of work should ICANN and the ICANN community place its efforts and priorities on?
   1. Participation in, support and/or oversight of emerging industry standards
   2. Development and promotion of tools and educational materials
   3. Document and maintain a set of "checklist" or guidelines for new IDN TLDs
   4. Organizing and supporting relevant events (along with speaking engagements)
   5. Support for IDN TLDs in relevant local initiatives

[THE ABOVE LIST IS A FIRST DRAFT FOR DISCUSSION SO FAR.]

**III. Preliminary Viewpoints & Possible Approaches**

[THE FOLLOWING SESSION IS FOR DISCUSSION PURPOSES ONLY]

**1. Are there policy aspects to be considered and/or policies to be implemented at ICANN?**

a) Budgeting policies?

[Allocation of budget specifically for the promotion of the Universal Acceptance of IDN TLDs]

b) Registry policies? IDN ccTLDs and/vs. IDN gTLDs?

[Require that all IDN TLDs commit to promoting Universal Acceptance of IDN TLDs within their systems]

**2. Which organizations should ICANN work with on the issue and how should ICANN identify such organizations?**

a) Industry, regional and related organizations

i) Industry organizations, e.g. IDN SDC, etc.

ii) Regional organizations, e.g. RIRs, ISP associations, etc.

iii) IT related organizations, e.g. WITSA (http://www.witsa.org), etc.

[How to identify the organizations and establish working relationship?]

b) Emerging industry standards

i) Public Suffix List currently maintained at Mozilla

ii) Wikipedia TLD List

[How to identify emerging lists and establish working relationship?]

**3. Which areas should ICANN focus its efforts and exert its influence on?**

a) Browsers and DNS Lookup tools and components

b) Network infrastructure, hosting and email providers

c) Network management and security tools

d) Applications and databases (where domains, email addresses and/or URLs represents a data object maintained, e.g. user profiles, contact information, search engines, etc.)

e) Registries, Registrars and RIR systems

[How to prioritize? What else should be included?]

**4. What types of work should ICANN and the ICANN community place its efforts and priorities on?**

a) Participation in, support and/or oversight of emerging industry standards

[Ensuring the integrity of the single unique authoritative root for the Internet, and exploring appropriateness of playing an oversight role in TLDs included]

b) Development and promotion of tools and educational materials

Expand, update and maintain the TLD Verification code

[Develop educational materials for developers and infrastructure providers, etc.]

c) Document and maintain a set of "checklist" or guidelines for new IDN TLDs

[How to coordinate and maintain work?]

d) Organizing and supporting relevant events (along with speaking engagements)

e) Support for IDN TLDs in relevant local initiatives

[How to identify events and allocate budget?]